TO: Docket Control

FROM: Ernest G. Johnson
       Director
       Utilities Division

DATE: April 08, 2009

RE: STAFF RESPONSE - IN THE MATTER OF THE REVIEW AND POSSIBLE REVISION OF ARIZONA UNIVERSAL SERVICE FUND RULES, ARTICLE 12 OF THE ARIZONA ADMINISTRATIVE CODE
       (DOCKET NO. RT-00000H-97-0137)

       IN THE MATTER OF THE INVESTIGATION OF THE COST OF TELECOMMUNICATIONS ACCESS (DOCKET NO. T-00000D-00-0672)

By Procedural Order dated March 20, 2009, Administrative Law Judge (“ALJ”) Jane Rodda required Staff to file by April 10, 2009, Comments and Recommendations concerning the appropriateness of including Qwest Corporation's switched access charges as part of phase II of the Access Charge Docket, and the relationship, if any, between these dockets and the Renewal of Qwest's Price Cap Plan in Docket No. T-01051B-03-0454. Staff believes that Qwest's Access Charges should be addressed in the pending Price Cap Plan Renewal docket. Staff's position on this issue in unchanged from its position set forth in its November 3, 2003, Memorandum of Law on Process Issues in this Docket which addressed the bifurcation issue.

ALJ Dwight Nodes' November 17, 2003, Procedural Order in this docket reached the following conclusion on the issue of bifurcation:

The general consensus of all parties is that access charges may not be reduced outside the context of a rate setting proceeding unless, at a minimum, a revenue-neutral mechanism is developed. Due to these limitations, and because Qwest has requested a review of its current rate cap plan in Docket No. T-01051B-03-0454, it is appropriate to consider Qwest's access charges in conjunction with its rate cap review, where all of Qwest's rates will be analyzed. However, the independent telephone company access charges must be considered separately because there are no existing price cap plans or rate cases currently pending for those entities. Accordingly, the Access Charge Docket will be bifurcated into two phases, Phase I will address Qwest's access charges in combination with the review of Qwest's price cap plan. Phase II will consider access charges for all other telephone carriers that provide access services.
As a result of the bifurcation, Qwest's Access rates were addressed in the context of its initial Price Cap Plan and the renewal of its Price Cap Plan. Qwest currently provides service under the terms of a currently effective and negotiated Renewed Price Cap Plan, which was approved by the Arizona Corporation Commission ("Commission") in Decision No. 68604, dated March 23, 2006. Prior to that decision, Qwest provided service under the terms of the Price Cap Plan, approved by the Commission in Decision No. 63487, dated March 30, 2001.

Under the terms of the initial Price Cap Plan implemented April 1, 2001, Qwest was required to reduce intrastate switched access charges. Section 3(d) of the Plan provides:

...Intrastate Switched Access Services which are to be reduced by $5 million per year for the duration of the initial term of the Plan, with further reductions in Intrastate Switched Access Service rates taking place during any subsequent term of the Price Cap Plan with the objective of obtaining parity with interstate switched access rates.

Under the terms of the Renewed Price Cap Plan implemented on April 1, 2006, Qwest was required to reduce intrastate switched access charges. Section 8 of the Renewed Price Cap Plan states:

Qwest shall make Switched Access Charge (Basket 4) reductions totaling $12.0 Million at the start of Year 1 of the Renewed Price Cap Plan. This shall be a permanent reduction in Switched Access Charges. The Parties agree that the $12 Million reduction shall be revenue neutral. Qwest's revised Switched Access Charge rates are attached as Attachment C.

As a result of Initial and Renewed Price Cap Plans, Qwest has implemented $27,000,000 in annual Switched Access Charge rate reduction, based on minute quantities that existed at the time that the plans were implemented.

Staff believes that it would not be appropriate to include Qwest's access rates in Phase II of this docket for two reasons. First, as noted above, Qwest access rates have in fact been reduced as a result of the two Price Cap Plans that have been implemented since 2001. Second, and more importantly, because Qwest rates are currently subject to a Price Cap Plan (which was negotiated by Qwest, Staff and some of the same parties that are participating in this docket) and because a review of the currently effective Price Cap Plan is currently pending, Staff believes that it would more appropriate to address Qwest's access rates in the Renewed Price Cap Plan Review docket.

In summary, Qwest's Access charge levels should continue to be addressed in the Renewed Price Cap Plan docket. Notwithstanding, Staff believes that the ALJ's inclusion of Qwest in this generic docket designed to address policy issues concerning assess charges, is appropriate.
Service List for: Investigation of the Cost of Telecommunications Access
Docket Nos.: RT-00000H-97-0137 and T-00000D-00-0672

** Parties marked with a “**” have agreed to accept service electronically.

Mr. Dan Pozefsky, Chief Counsel
Residential Utility Consumer Office
1110 West Washington Street, Suite 220
Phoenix, Arizona 85007
dpozefshy@azrulo.gov *

Mr. Thomas W. Bade, President
Arizona Dialtone, Inc.
6115 South Kyrene Road, Suite 103
Tempe, Arizona 85283
Tombade@arizonadialtone.com *

Mr. Norm Curtright
Corporate Counsel
Qwest Corporation
20 East Thomas Road, 16th Floor
Phoenix, Arizona 85012

Mr. Mark A. DiNunzio
Cox Arizona Telecom, LLC
1550 West Deer Valley Road
MS DV3-16, Bldg C
Phoenix, Arizona 85027
mark.dinunzio@cox.com *

Mr. Reed Peterson
Qwest Corporation
20 East Thomas Road, 16th floor
Phoenix, Arizona 85012

Mr. Mark A. DiNunzio
Cox Arizona Telecom, LLC
1550 West Deer Valley Road
MS DV3-16, Bldg C
Phoenix, Arizona 85027
mark.dinunzio@cox.com *

Mr. Michael W. Patten
Roshka De Wulf & Patten, PLC
One Arizona Center
400 East Van Buren Street, Suite 800
Phoenix, Arizona 85004
mpatten@rdp-law.com *
Attorneys for Cox Arizona Telecom, LLC
Attorneys for McLeodUSA

Mr. William A. Haas
Deputy General Counsel
McLeodUSA Telecommunications Services, Inc.
6400 C Street SW
Post Office Box 3177
Cedar Rapids, Iowa 52406
Bill.Haas@mcleodusa.com

Mr. Michael W. Patten
Roshka De Wulf & Patten, PLC
One Arizona Center
400 East Van Buren Street, Suite 800
Phoenix, Arizona 85004
mpatten@rdp-law.com *
Attorneys for Cox Arizona Telecom, LLC
Attorneys for McLeodUSA

Mr. Craig A. Marks
Craig A. Marks, PLC
10645 N. Tatum Boulevard, Suite 200-676
Phoenix, Arizona 85028
Craig.Marks@azbar.org
Attorney for ALECA

Mr. William A. Haas
Deputy General Counsel
McLeodUSA Telecommunications Services, Inc.
6400 C Street SW
Post Office Box 3177
Cedar Rapids, Iowa 52406
Bill.Haas@mcleodusa.com

Mr. Craig A. Marks
Craig A. Marks, PLC
10645 N. Tatum Boulevard, Suite 200-676
Phoenix, Arizona 85028
Craig.Marks@azbar.org
Attorney for ALECA

Ms. Isabelle Salgado
AT&T Nevada
645 E. Plumb Lane, B132
Post Office Box 11010
Reno, Nevada 89520
dan.foley@att.com *
gc1831@att.com *

Mr. Michael M. Grant
Gallagher & Kennedy
2575 East Camelback Road
Phoenix, Arizona 85016
mmg@gknet.com *
Attorneys for AT&T

Mr. Michael M. Grant
Gallagher & Kennedy
2575 East Camelback Road
Phoenix, Arizona 85016
mmg@gknet.com *
Attorneys for AT&T
Ms. Joan S. Burke
Osborn Macedon, PA
2929 North Central Avenue, Suite 2100
Phoenix, Arizona 85012
jburke@omlaw.com
Attorneys for Time Warner Telecom
Attorneys for XO Communications

Lyndall Nipps
Vice President, Regulatory
Time Warner Telecom
845 Camino Sur
Palm Springs, California 92262
Lyndall.Nipps@twtelecom.com

Mr. Dennis D. Ahlers
Associate General Counsel
Eschelon Telecom, Inc.
730 Second Avenue, Suite 900
Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402
ddahlers@eschelon.com

Mr. Thomas Campbell
Mr. Michael Hallam
Lewis and Roca LLP
40 North Central Avenue
Phoenix, Arizona 85004
tcampbell@lrlaw.com
mhallam@lrlaw.com
Attorneys for Verizon

Mr. Rex Knowles
Executive Director – Regulatory
XO Communications
111 East Broadway, Suite 100
Salt Lake City, Utah 84111
Rex.knowles@xo.com

Mr. Charles H. Carrathers, III
General Counsel, South Central Region
Verizon, Inc.
600 Hidden Ridge
HQE03H52
Irving, Texas 75015-2092
chuck.carrathers@verizon.com

Arizona Payphone Association
c/o Mr. Gary Joseph
Sharenet Communications
4633 West Polk Street
Phoenix, Arizona 85043
garyj@nationalbrands.com

Mr. Nathan Glazier
Associate Director, Public Policy
Verizon Wireless
4805 East Thistle Landing Drive
Phoenix, Arizona 85044
Nathan.Glazier@verizonwireless.com

Mr. Chris Rossie
President, Local 7019
Communication Workers of America
11070 North 24th Avenue
Phoenix, Arizona 85029

Mr. Stephen H. Kukta
Director and Counsel
Sprint Nextel
201 Mission Street, Suite 1500
San Francisco, California 94105
Stephen.h.kukta@sprint.com

Ms. Janice M. Alward
Chief Counsel, Legal Division
Arizona Corporation Commission
1200 West Washington Street
Phoenix, Arizona 85007

Mr. Ernest G. Johnson
Director, Utilities Division
Arizona Corporation Commission
1200 West Washington Street
Phoenix, Arizona 85007
Ms. Lyn Farmer  
Chief Administrative Law Judge, Hearing  
Division, Arizona Corporation Commission  
1200 West Washington Street  
Phoenix, Arizona 85007